



## Sixth International Conference on Grey Literature

New York, N.Y., USA

6-7 December 2004

# Trend evaluation and comparison of the use and value of GL in core demography and computer science journals

Rosa Di Cesare, Roberta Ruggieri, CNR-IRPPS  
Silvia Giannini, Stefania Biagioni, CNR-ISTI



ISTITUTO DI SCIENZA E TECNOLOGIE  
DELL'INFORMAZIONE "A. FAEDO"





## The idea ....

- To measure the impact of GL on different scientific fields
- To describe the characteristics of GL documents cited
- To ascertain any changes in GL impact on 1995 and 2003

# Sampled Journals: Demography (DEM) and Computer Science-Information Systems (CS-IS)

| <b>DEM Journals</b>  | <b>IF 1995 (*)</b> | <b>Rank 1995<br/>(1/17)</b> | <b>IF 2002 (*)</b> | <b>Rank 2002<br/>(1/17)</b> |
|--|--------------------|-----------------------------|--------------------|-----------------------------|
| Demography   | 1633               | 1/17                        | 2.060              | 2/17                        |
| Population Research & Policy Review  | 0.368              | 11/17                       | 0.510              | 10/17                       |
| International Migration  | 0.137              | 16/17                       | 0.357              | 14/17                       |
| All indexed by ISI, Popindex, CICRED   |                    |                             |                    |                             |
| (*) ISI-JCR Social Science ed., 1995 e 2002; Category: Demography: ISI rank 1/17 |                    |                             |                    |                             |

| <b>CS-IS Journals</b>   | <b>IF 1995 (*)</b> | <b>Rank 1995<br/>(1/43)</b> | <b>IF 2002 (*)</b> | <b>Rank 2002<br/>(1/77)</b> |
|---|--------------------|-----------------------------|--------------------|-----------------------------|
| ACM Transactions on Information Systems (ACM TOIS)  | 1.176              | 4/43                        | 1.385              | 12/77                       |
| ACM Transactions on Database Systems (ACM TODS)   | 0.829              | 9/43                        | 0.875              | 27/77                       |
| Information Sciences  | 0.245              | 30/43                       | 0.361              | 54/77                       |
| All indexed by ISI, INSPEC, EI Compendex  |                    |                             |                    |                             |
| (*) ISI-JCR Social Science ed., 1995 e 2002; Category: Computer Science-Information Systems: ISI rank 1/43 e 1/77 |                    |                             |                    |                             |

Table 1

Table 1 compares the IF and the rank in the “Demography” and in the “Computer Science - Information systems” categories in the two years examined

# Frequency of GL use (1995 vs. 2003)

|                         |            | 1995      | Number of articles GL | Number of Frequency articles with of GL use (%) | Number of articles | 2003       | Number of Frequency articles with of GL use (%) |
|-------------------------|------------|-----------|-----------------------|---|--------------------|------------|---|
| <b>DEM Journals</b>     |            |           |                       |   |                    |            |   |
| Demography              | 37         | 37        | 100.0                 | 38  | 38                 | 38         | 100.0   |
| Popul Res Policy Rev    | 27         | 23        | 85.2                  | 37  | 36                 | 36         | 97.3  |
| International Migration | 21         | 21        | 100.0                 | 39  | 38                 | 38         | 97.4  |
| <b>Total</b>            | <b>85</b>  | <b>81</b> | <b>95.3</b>           | <b>114</b>                                      | <b>112</b>         | <b>112</b> | <b>98.2</b>                                     |
| <b>CS-IS Journals</b>   |            |           |                       |   |                    |            |   |
| ACM TOIS                | 16         | 15        | 93.8                  | 15  | 14                 | 14         | 93.3  |
| ACM TODS                | 12         | 12        | 100.0                 | 15  | 13                 | 13         | 86.7  |
| Information Sciences    | 84         | 58        | 69.0                  | 137   | 100                | 100        | 73.0  |
| <b>Total</b>            | <b>112</b> | <b>85</b> | <b>75.9</b>           | <b>167</b>                                      | <b>127</b>         | <b>127</b> | <b>76.0</b>                                     |

Table 2

DEM: the frequency of GL use increased  
 CS-IS: the frequency of GL use remained stable

# Frequency of GL citing (1995 vs. 2003)



| DEM Journals            | 1995                 |                         |                            | 2003                 |                         |                            |
|-------------------------|----------------------|-------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|-------------------------|----------------------------|
|                         | Number of references | Number of GL references | Frequency of GL citing (%) | Number of references | Number of GL references | Frequency of GL citing (%) |
| Demography              | 1,277                | 237                     | 18.7                       | 1,795                | 326                     | 18.2                       |
| Popul Res Policy Rev    | 779                  | 295                     | 37.9                       | 1,088                | 210                     | 19.3                       |
| International Migration | 773                  | 413                     | 53.4                       | 1,298                | 444                     | 34.2                       |
| <b>Total</b>            | <b>2,822</b>         | <b>945</b>              | <b>33.5</b>                | <b>4,181</b>         | <b>980</b>              | <b>23.4</b>                |
| <hr/>                   |                      |                         |                            |                      |                         |                            |
| CS-IS Journals          |                      |                         |                            |                      |                         |                            |
| ACM TOIS                | 618                  | 71                      | 11.5                       | 602                  | 127                     | 21.1                       |
| ACM TODS                | 441                  | 45                      | 10.2                       | 621                  | 58                      | 9.3                        |
| Information Sciences    | 1,502                | 172                     | 11.5                       | 2,649                | 434                     | 16.4                       |

Table 3

DEM: the frequency of GL citing decreased  
CS-IS: the frequency of GL citing increased

## Intensity of GL use (1995 vs.2003)



| DEM Journals              | IF    | 1995                    |    | 2003                    |             |
|---------------------------|-------|-------------------------|----|-------------------------|-------------|
|                           |       | Intensity of GL use (%) | IF | Intensity of GL use (%) | IF          |
| Popul Res Policy Rev      | 0.368 | 44.2                    |    | 0.510                   | 19.8        |
| International Migration   | 0.137 | 53.4                    |    | 0.357                   | 35.4        |
| <b>Total</b>              |       | <b>35.2</b>             |    |                         | <b>23.8</b> |
| <br><b>CS-IS Journals</b> |       |                         |    |                         |             |
| ACM TOIS                  | 1.176 | 11.9                    |    | 1.385                   | 22.6        |
| ACM TODS                  | 0.829 | 10.2                    |    | 0.875                   | 10.7        |
| Information Sciences      | 0.245 | 16.7                    |    | 0.361                   | 22.5        |
| <b>Total</b>              |       | <b>14.28</b>            |    |                         | <b>21.0</b> |

Table 4

DEM: the intensity of GL use decreased; CS-IS: the intensity of GL use increased.  
 The journal “Demography” with highest IF shows stable values for all three indicators.  
 For the journal “ACM-TOIS” with highest IF, the only stable value is the frequency of GL use

# Frequency of e-GL use (1995 vs. 2003)

|                         |        | 1995                    |                           | 2004                  |                              |
|-------------------------|--------|-------------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|------------------------------|
| DEM Journals            |        | Number of GL references | Number of e-GL references | Frequency of e-GL use | Number of e-GL available (%) |
| Popul Rev               | Policy | 295                     | 0                         | 0.0                   | 0.0                          |
| International Migration |        | 413                     | 0                         | 0.0                   | 0.0                          |
| <b>Total</b>            |        | <b>945</b>              | <b>0</b>                  | <b>0.0</b>            | <b>0.0</b>                   |
| <b>CS-IS Journals</b>   |        |                         |                           |                       |                              |
| ACM TOIS                |        | 69                      | 9                         | 13.3                  | 2                            |
| ACM TODS                |        | 45                      | 2                         | 16.7                  | 1                            |
| Sciences                |        | 172                     | 0                         | 0.0                   | 0.0                          |
| <b>Total</b>            |        | <b>286</b>              | <b>11</b>                 | <b>4.7</b>            | <b>27.3</b>                  |

Most of the e-GL citations were concentrated in the CS-IS field. 27% of 1995 and 82% of 2003 citations are still available.

|                         |        | 2003                    |                           | 2004                  |                              |
|-------------------------|--------|-------------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|------------------------------|
| DEM Journals            |        | Number of GL references | Number of e-GL references | Frequency of e-GL use | Number of e-GL available (%) |
| Popul Rev               | Policy | 210                     | 12                        | 16.7                  | 5                            |
| International Migration |        | 444                     | 58                        | 47.4                  | 42                           |
| <b>Total</b>            |        | <b>980</b>              | <b>102</b>                | <b>35.7</b>           | <b>72</b>                    |
| <b>CS-IS Journals</b>   |        |                         |                           |                       |                              |
| ACM TOIS                |        | 127                     | 49                        | 78.6                  | 40                           |
| ACM TODS                |        | 58                      | 17                        | 38.5                  | 16                           |
| Information Sciences    |        | 434                     | 87                        | 25.0                  | 70                           |
| <b>Total</b>            |        | <b>619</b>              | <b>153</b>                | <b>32.3</b>           | <b>126</b>                   |
|                         |        |                         |                           |                       |                              |
|                         |        |                         |                           |                       |                              |

Table 5

# Distribution of GL documents by document type (1995 vs. 2003)

| DEM                | 1995       | 2003         |            |              |
|--------------------|------------|--------------|------------|--------------|
| Document type      | Number     | (%)          | Number     | (%)          |
| Thesis             | 16         | 1.7          | 30         | 3.1          |
| Report             | 189        | 20.0         | 183        | 18.7         |
| Preprint           | 0          | 0.0          | 0          | 0.0          |
| Proc/Meeting p.    | 169        | 17.9         | 116        | 11.8         |
| Unpublished        | 26         | 2.8          | 13         | 1.3          |
| Technical Doc      | 19         | 2.0          | 21         | 2.1          |
| Miscellaneous      | 26         | 2.8          | 53         | 5.4          |
| Undefined          | 3          | 0.3          | 27         | 2.8          |
| Home Page          | 0          | 0.0          | 25         | 2.6          |
| Monographic book   | 233        | 24.7         | 236        | 24.1         |
| Statistical report | 264        | 27.9         | 267        | 27.2         |
| Db, Di, Archive    | 0          | 0.0          | 9          | 0.9          |
| <b>Total</b>       | <b>945</b> | <b>100.0</b> | <b>980</b> | <b>100.0</b> |

DEM - most of the cited documents were: Monographic books and Statistical reports

CS-IS - most of the cited documents were: Technical reports, Proceedings and Theses

| DEM                | 1995       | 2003         |            |              |
|--------------------|------------|--------------|------------|--------------|
| Document type      | Number     | (%)          | Number     | (%)          |
| Thesis             | 43         | 14.9         | 69         | 11.1         |
| Report             | 85         | 29.5         | 119        | 19.2         |
| Preprint           | 25         | 8.7          | 19         | 3.1          |
| Proc/Meeting p.    | 72         | 25.0         | 238        | 38.4         |
| Unpublished        | 5          | 1.7          | 1          | 0.2          |
| Technical Doc      | 47         | 16.3         | 110        | 17.8         |
| Miscellaneous      | 3          | 1.0          | 12         | 1.9          |
| Undefined          | 7          | 2.4          | 11         | 1.8          |
| Home Page          | 1          | 0.3          | 23         | 3.7          |
| Monographic book   | 0          | 0.0          | 8          | 1.3          |
| Statistical report | 0          | 0.0          | 0          | 0.0          |
| Db, Di, Archive    | 0          | 0.0          | 9          | 1.5          |
| <b>Total</b>       | <b>288</b> | <b>100.0</b> | <b>619</b> | <b>100.0</b> |

Note that in 2003, in both disciplines, authors started linking citations to specific “Home Pages”

Table 6

# Distribution of GL documents by date (1995 vs. 2003)

## DEM Journals

1995

| Date         | Frequency  | Cumulative frequency(%) | Date       | Frequency    | Cumulative frequency(%) |
|--------------|------------|-------------------------|------------|--------------|-------------------------|
| 1995         | 9          | 1.0                     | 2003       | 40           | 4.1                     |
| 1994         | 84         | 9.8                     | 2002       | 135          | 17.2                    |
| 1993         | 150        | 25.7                    | 2001       | 141          | 32.2                    |
| 1992         | 100        | 36.3                    | 2000       | 107          | 43.2                    |
| 1991         | 94         | 46.2                    | 1999       | 96           | 53.0                    |
| 1990         | 97         | 56.5                    | 1998       | 57           | 58.8                    |
| 1989         | 51         | 61.9                    | 1997       | 67           | 65.6                    |
| 1988         | 63         | 68.6                    | 1996       | 44           | 70.1                    |
| 1987         | 29         | 71.6                    | 1995       | 44           | 74.6                    |
| 1986         | 29         | 74.7                    | 1994       | 30           | 77.6                    |
| 1985-1976    | 166        | 92.3                    | 1993-1984  | 151          | 93.1                    |
| 1975-1966    | 31         | 95.5                    | 1983-1974  | 32           | 96.3                    |
| 1965-1956    | 10         | 96.6                    | 1973-1964  | 17           | 98.1                    |
| 1955-1900    | 21         | 98.8                    | 1963-1900  | 6            | 0.1                     |
| [s.d]        | 11         | 1.2                     | [s.d]      | 13           | 1.3                     |
| <b>TOTAL</b> | <b>945</b> |                         | <b>980</b> | <b>100.0</b> |                         |

DEM

1995: more than 50% of the citations were related to the last five years before 1995  
 2003: more than 50% of the citations were related to the last four years before 2003

## CS-IS Journals

1995

| Date         | Frequency  | Cumulative frequency(%) | Date       | Frequency | Cumulative frequency(%) |
|--------------|------------|-------------------------|------------|-----------|-------------------------|
| 1995         | 18         | 6.3                     | 2003       | 17        | 2.7                     |
| 1994         | 24         | 14.6                    | 2002       | 43        | 9.7                     |
| 1993         | 35         | 26.7                    | 2001       | 84        | 23.3                    |
| 1992         | 41         | 41.0                    | 2000       | 57        | 32.5                    |
| 1991         | 49         | 58.0                    | 1999       | 59        | 42.0                    |
| 1990         | 23         | 66.0                    | 1998       | 51        | 50.2                    |
| 1989         | 14         | 70.8                    | 1997       | 50        | 58.3                    |
| 1988         | 12         | 75.0                    | 1996       | 35        | 64.0                    |
| 1987         | 10         | 78.5                    | 1995       | 40        | 70.4                    |
| 1986         | 5          | 80.2                    | 1994       | 21        | 73.8                    |
| 1985-1976    | 29         | 90.3                    | 1993-1984  | 78        | 86.4                    |
| 1975-1966    | 8          | 93.1                    | 1983-1974  | 13        | 88.5                    |
| 1965-1956    | 1          | 93.4                    | 1973-1964  | 6         | 89.5                    |
| 1955-1900    | 0          | 0.0                     | 1963-1900  | 0         | 0.0                     |
| [s.d]        | 19         | 6.6                     | [s.d]      | 65        | 10.5                    |
| <b>TOTAL</b> | <b>288</b> |                         | <b>619</b> |           |                         |

2003

## CS-IS

1995: more than 50% of the citations were related to the last four years before 1995  
 2003: more than 50% of the citations were related to the last five years before 2003

Table 7

GL6 - December, 6-7 2004

# Distribution of Self-citations (1995 vs. 2003)

|                         |                                | <b>1995</b>                    |                                | <b>2003</b>                    |             |
|-------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------------------------|-------------|
| <b>DEM Journals</b>     | <b>Number of GL references</b> | <b>Number of Self-cit. (%)</b> | <b>Number of GL references</b> | <b>Number of Self-cit. (%)</b> |             |
| Demography              | 237                            | 21                             | 8.9                            | 326                            | 14          |
| Popul Res Policy Rev    | 295                            | 13                             | 4.4                            | 210                            | 12          |
| International Migration | 413                            | 52                             | 12.6                           | 444                            | 25          |
| <b>Total</b>            | <b>945</b>                     | <b>86</b>                      | <b>25.9</b>                    | <b>980</b>                     | <b>51</b>   |
| <b>CS-IS Journals</b>   |                                |                                |                                |                                |             |
| ACM TOIS                | 71                             | 17                             | 23.9                           | 127                            | 22          |
| ACM TODS                | 45                             | 12                             | 26.7                           | 58                             | 12          |
| Information Sciences    | 172                            | 68                             | 39.5                           | 434                            | 99          |
| <b>Total</b>            | <b>288</b>                     | <b>97</b>                      | <b>33.7</b>                    | <b>619</b>                     | <b>133</b>  |
|                         |                                |                                |                                |                                | <b>21.5</b> |

Table 8

Note that the journals with low IF seem to be more affected by the phenomenon of self-citing. In 2003, in both disciplinary fields the proportion of self-citations decreased