

## Performance of legume-based annual forage crops in three semi-arid Mediterranean environments

P. Annicchiarico,<sup>1,\*</sup> I. Thami Alami,<sup>2</sup> K. Abbas,<sup>3</sup> L. Pecetti,<sup>1</sup> R. A. M. Melis,<sup>4</sup> C. Porqueddu<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Council for Agricultural Research and Economics (CREA), Research Centre for Fodder Crops and Dairy

<sup>2</sup>Institut National de la Recherche Agronomique (INRA), Centre Régional de Rabat, Rabat, Morocco.

<sup>3</sup>Institut National de la Recherche Agronomique d'Algérie (INRAA), Agro-system East Division, Sétif,

<sup>4</sup>National Research Council (CNR), Institute for the Animal Production System in the Mediterranean En

*Crop and Pasture Science*, 68(10–11):932-941 (2017). <https://doi.org/10.1071/CP17068>

### Abstract

Legume-based annual forages could be pivotal for the sustainable intensification of forage production in drought-prone Mediterranean cereal-livestock systems. This study aimed to optimise the composition of these crops for three climatically contrasting areas. Four legumes (field pea of semi-dwarf and tall type; Narbon vetch; common vetch) and two cereals (oat; triticale) were grown in three autumn-sown sites (Sassari, Italy; Sétif, Algeria; Marchouch, Morocco) for 2 years as pure stands and legume-cereal binary and four-component mixtures. We assessed dry matter yield, weed content and farmers' acceptability of the crops, and legume content and Land Equivalent Ratio of the mixtures. Legumes' competitive disadvantage ranged from very high in Sétif to nearly nil in Sassari. Pea- and common vetch-based mixtures outperformed Narbon vetch-based ones in terms of yield, legume content and farmers' acceptability. The tall pea, featuring greatest competitive ability against cereals, maximised the yield and legume content of legume-cereal crops. Vetch-cereal mixtures exhibited lower weed content than the average of the components' pure stands. Oat monoculture was top-yielding but modestly appreciated by farmers. Pea provided the only legume monoculture combining good yielding ability and high farmers' appreciation. Greater species diversity as provided by complex mixtures did not display any production advantage over binary mixtures.

© CSIRO 2017

### References

Alessandri A, De Felice M, Zeng N, Mariotti A, Pan Y, Cherchi A, Lee J-Y, Wang B, Ha K-J, Ruti P, Artale V (2014) Robust assessment of the expansion and retreat of Mediterranean climate in the 21st century. *Scientific Reports* **4**, 7211

| [Robust assessment of the expansion and retreat of Mediterranean climate in the 21<sup>st</sup> century](#).Crossref | [GoogleScholar](#)  
[Google Scholar](#) | [1: CAS:528:DC%2BC2MXksVWjtrg%3D&md5=c5002ef2b5bc123636b368d34fff381cCAS](#) |

Andersen MK, Hauggaard-Nielsen H, Ambus P, Jensen ES (2005) Biomass production, symbiotic nitrogen fixation and inorganic N use in dual and tri-component annual intercrops. *Plant and Soil* **266**, 273–287.

| [Biomass production, symbiotic nitrogen fixation and inorganic N use in dual and tri-component annual intercrops](#).Crossref | [GoogleScholar](#)  
[Google Scholar](#) |

Anil L, Park RHP, Miller FA (1998) Temperate intercropping of cereals for forage: a review of the potential for growth and utilization with particular reference to the UK. *Grass and Forage Science* **53**, 301–317.

| [Temperate intercropping of cereals for forage: a review of the potential for growth and utilization with](#)

[particular reference to the UK](#).[Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Annicchiarico P, Filippi L (2007) A field pea ideotype for organic systems of northern Italy. *Journal of Crop Improvement* **20**, 193–203.

| [A field pea ideotype for organic systems of northern Italy](#).[Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Annicchiarico P, Iannucci A (2008) Adaptation strategy, germplasm type and adaptive traits for field pea improvement in Italy based on variety responses across climatically contrasting environments. *Field Crops Research* **108**, 133–142.

| [Adaptation strategy, germplasm type and adaptive traits for field pea improvement in Italy based on variety responses across climatically contrasting environments](#).[Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Annicchiarico P, Piano E (1994) Interference effects in white clover genotypes grown as pure stands and binary mixtures with different grass species and varieties. *Theoretical and Applied Genetics* **88**, 153–158.

| [Interference effects in white clover genotypes grown as pure stands and binary mixtures with different grass species and varieties](#).[Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google](#)

Scholar | [1:STN:280:DC%2BC2c7isVOqtg%3D%3D&md5=b3493b44ff6a66cb620880a4c8035f67CAS](#) |

Annicchiarico P, Proietti S (2010) White clover selected for competitive ability widens the compatibility with grasses and favours the optimization of legume content and forage yield in mown clover-grass mixtures. *Grass and Forage Science* **65**, 318–324.

| [White clover selected for competitive ability widens the compatibility with grasses and favours the optimization of legume content and forage yield in mown clover-grass mixtures](#).[Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Annicchiarico P, Ruda P, Sulas C, Pitzalis M, Salis M, Romani M, Carroni AM (2012) Optimal plant type of pea for mixed cropping with cereals. In ‘Breeding strategies for sustainable forage and turf grass improvement’. (Eds S Barth, D Milbourne) pp. 341–346. (Springer Science: Dordrecht, The Netherlands)

Annicchiarico P, Thami Alami I, Souihka A, Pecetti L (2017) Breeding, design and assessment of annual and perennial legume-based forage crops. *Grassland Science in Europe* **22**, 292–295.

Ates S, Feindel D, El-Moneim A, Ryan J (2014) Annual forage legumes in dryland agricultural systems of the West Asia and North Africa Regions: research achievements and future perspective. *Grass and Forage Science* **69**, 17–31.

| [Annual forage legumes in dryland agricultural systems of the West Asia and North Africa Regions: research achievements and future perspective](#).[Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Bedoussac L, Justes E (2010) Dynamic analysis of competition and complementarity for light and N use to understand the yield and the protein content of a durum wheat–winter pea intercrop. *Plant and Soil* **330**, 37–54.

| [Dynamic analysis of competition and complementarity for light and N use to understand the yield and the protein content of a durum wheat–winter pea intercrop](#).[Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google](#)

Brophy C, Finn JA, Lüscher A, Suter M, Kirwan L, Sebastià M-T, Helgadóttir Á, Baadshaug OH, Bélanger G, Black A, Collins RP, Čop J, Dalmannsdottir S, Delgado I, Elgersma A, Fothergill M, Frankow-Lindberg BE, Ghesquiere A, Golinska B, Golinski P, Grieu P, Gustavsson A-M, Höglind M, Huguenin-Elie O, Jørgensen M, Kadzuliene Z, Kurki P, Llurba R, Lunنان T, Porqueddu C, Thumm U, Connolly J (2017) Major shifts in species' relative abundance in grassland mixtures alongside positive effects of species diversity in yield: a continental-scale experiment. *Journal of Ecology*

| [Major shifts in species' relative abundance in grassland mixtures alongside positive effects of species diversity in yield: a continental-scale experiment.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) | in press.

Caballero R, Goicoechea EL, Hernaiz PJ (1995) Forage yields and quality of common vetch and oat sown at varying seeding ratios and seeding rates of vetch. *Field Crops Research* **41**, 135–140.

| [Forage yields and quality of common vetch and oat sown at varying seeding ratios and seeding rates of vetch.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Carita T, Simões N, Carneiro JP, Moreira J, Bagulho AS (2016) Forage yield and quality of simple and complex grass-legumes mixtures under Mediterranean conditions. *Emirates Journal of Food and Agriculture* **28**, 501–505.

| [Forage yield and quality of simple and complex grass-legumes mixtures under Mediterranean conditions.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Ceccarelli S, Guimarães EP, Weltzien E (2009) 'Plant breeding and farmer participation.' (FAO: Rome)

Cellier P, Schneider A, Thiébeau P, Vertès F (2015) Impacts environnementaux de l'introduction de légumineuses dans les systèmes de production. In 'Les légumineuses pour des systèmes agricoles et alimentaires durables'. (Eds A Schneider, C Huyghe) pp. 297–338. (Editions Quae: Versailles, France)

Chapagain T, Riseman A (2014) Barley-pea intercropping: effects on land productivity, carbon and nitrogen transformations. *Field Crops Research* **166**, 18–25.

| [Barley-pea intercropping: effects on land productivity, carbon and nitrogen transformations.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Chapko LB, Brinkman MA, Albrecht KA (1991) Oat, oat-pea, barley, and barley-pea for forage yield, forage quality, and alfalfa establishment. *Journal of Production Agriculture* **4**, 486–491.

| [Oat, oat-pea, barley, and barley-pea for forage yield, forage quality, and alfalfa establishment.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Corre-Hellou G, Fustec J, Crozat Y (2006) Interspecific competition for soil N and its interaction with N<sub>2</sub> fixation, leaf expansion and crop growth in pea-barley intercrops. *Plant and Soil* **282**, 195–208.

| [Interspecific competition for soil N and its interaction with N<sub>2</sub> fixation, leaf expansion and crop growth in pea-barley intercrops.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

[Scholar](#) | [1:CAR:528:DC%2BD28XmtVOqurg%3D&md5=45e0e21dfeee46fba122700940f0bc2cCAS](#) |

Delgado C, Rosegrant M, Steinfeld H, Ehui S, Courbois C (1999) 'Livestock to 2020: the next food revolution.' (IFPRI: Washington, DC)

Ehrmann J, Ritz K (2014) Plant: soil interactions in temperate multi-cropping production systems. *Plant and Soil* **376**, 1–29.

| [Plant: soil interactions in temperate multi-cropping production systems.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholarGoogle Scholar](#) | [1: CAS:528:DC%2BC3sXhsIaqLvk&md5=f086726ca9b8adac25dabebe139f8f74CAS](#) |

FAO (2010) 'The state of food and agriculture. Livestock in the balance.' (FAO: Rome)

Harper JL (1977) 'Population biology of plants.' (Academic Press: London)

Harris W (1987) Population dynamics and competition. In 'White clover'. (Eds MJ Baker, WM Williams) pp. 203–297. (CAB International: Wallingford, UK)

Hauggaard-Nielsen H, Jensen ES (2001) Evaluating pea and barley cultivars for complementarity in intercropping at different levels of soil N availability. *Field Crops Research* **72**, 185–196.

| [Evaluating pea and barley cultivars for complementarity in intercropping at different levels of soil N availability.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholarGoogle Scholar](#) |

Hauggaard-Nielsen H, Ambus P, Jensen ES (2001) Interspecific competition, N use and interference with weeds in pea-barley intercropping. *Field Crops Research* **70**, 101–109.

| [Interspecific competition, N use and interference with weeds in pea-barley intercropping.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholarGoogle Scholar](#) |

IPCC (2007) 'Climate change 2007: impacts, adaptation and vulnerability. Contribution of Working group II to the fourth assessment report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change.' (Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, UK)

Jedel PE, Helm JH (1993) Forage potential of pulse-cereal mixtures in central Alberta. *Canadian Journal of Plant Science* **73**, 437–444.

| [Forage potential of pulse-cereal mixtures in central Alberta.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholarGoogle Scholar](#) |

Jensen ES (1996) Barley uptake of N deposited in the rhizosphere of associated field pea. *Soil Biology & Biochemistry* **28**, 159–168.

| [Barley uptake of N deposited in the rhizosphere of associated field pea.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholarGoogle Scholar](#) | [1: CAS:528:DyaK28XhtIClbc%3D&md5=d9b7e7aeb2f0506554a6f5d1643ecd0bCAS](#) |

Kirwan L, Lüscher A, Sebastià MT, Finn JA, Collins RP, Porqueddu C, Helgadottir A, Baadshaug OH, Brophy C, Coran C, Dalmannsdóttir S, Delgado I, Elgersma A, Fothergill M, Frankow-Lindberg BE, Golinski P, Grieu P, Gustavsson AM, Höglind M, Huguenin-Elie O, Iliadis C, Jørgensen M, Kadziuliene Z, Karyotis T, Lunنان T, Malengier M, Maltoni S, Meyer V, Nyfeler D, Nykanen-Kurki P, Parente J, Smit HJ, Thumm U, Connolly J (2007) Evenness drives consistent diversity effects in intensive grassland systems across 28 European

sites. *Journal of Ecology* **95**, 530–539.

| [Evenness drives consistent diversity effects in intensive grassland systems across 28 European sites](#).Crossref | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Kurdali F, Sharabi NE, Arslan A (1996) Rainfed vetch-barley mixed cropping in the Syrian semi-arid conditions: I. Nitrogen nutrition using  $^{15}\text{N}$  isotopic dilution. *Plant and Soil* **183**, 137–148.

| [Rainfed vetch-barley mixed cropping in the Syrian semi-arid conditions: I. Nitrogen nutrition using  \$^{15}\text{N}\$  isotopic dilution](#).Crossref | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) | [1:CAR:528:DyaK28Xnt1arsbc%3D&md5=6308cb06660e95e6677a1fbe3e1d8b39CAS](#) |

Lemerle D, Gill GS, Murphy CE, Walker SR, Cousens RD, Mokhtari S, Peltzer SJ, Coleman R, Luckett DJ (2001) Genetic improvement and agronomy for enhanced wheat competitiveness with weeds. *Australian Journal of Agricultural Research* **52**, 527–548.

| [Genetic improvement and agronomy for enhanced wheat competitiveness with weeds](#).Crossref | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Liebman M, Dyck E (1993) Crop rotation and intercropping strategies for weed management. *Ecological Applications* **3**, 92–122.

| [Crop rotation and intercropping strategies for weed management](#).Crossref | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Lithourgidis AS, Vasilakoglu IB, Dhima KV, Dordas CA, Yiakoulaki MD (2006) Forage yield and quality of common vetch mixtures with oat and triticale in two seeding ratios. *Field Crops Research* **99**, 106–113.

| [Forage yield and quality of common vetch mixtures with oat and triticale in two seeding ratios](#).Crossref | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Lithourgidis AS, Vlachostergios DN, Dordas CA, Damalas CA (2011) Dry matter yield, nitrogen content, and competition in pea-cereal intercropping systems. *European Journal of Agronomy* **34**, 287–294.

| [Dry matter yield, nitrogen content, and competition in pea-cereal intercropping systems](#).Crossref | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Mariotti M, Masoni A, Ercoli L, Arduini I (2006) Forage potential of winter cereal/legume intercrops in organic farming. *Italian Journal of Agronomy* **1**, 403–412.

| [Forage potential of winter cereal/legume intercrops in organic farming](#).Crossref | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

McDonald GK (2003) Competitiveness against grass weeds in field pea genotypes. *Weed Research* **43**, 48–58.

| [Competitiveness against grass weeds in field pea genotypes](#).Crossref | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Mead R, Willey RW (1980) The concept of a land equivalent ratio and advantages in yields for intercropping. *Experimental Agriculture* **16**, 217–228.

| [The concept of a land equivalent ratio and advantages in yields for](#)

[intercropping.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Monti M, Pellicanò A, Santonoceto C, Preiti G, Pristeri A (2016) Yield components and nitrogen use in cereal-pea intercrops in Mediterranean environment. *Field Crops Research* **196**, 379–388.

| [Yield components and nitrogen use in cereal-pea intercrops in Mediterranean environment.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Moreira N (1989) The effect of seed rate and nitrogen fertilizer on the yield and nutritive value of oat-vetch mixtures. *The Journal of Agricultural Science* **112**, 57–66.

| [The effect of seed rate and nitrogen fertilizer on the yield and nutritive value of oat-vetch mixtures.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Nemecek T, Von Richthofen J-S, Dubois G, Casta P, Charles R, Pahl H (2008) Environmental impact of introducing grain legumes into European crop rotations. *European Journal of Agronomy* **28**, 380–393.

| [Environmental impact of introducing grain legumes into European crop rotations.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Neugschwandtner RW, Kaul H-P (2014) Sowing ratio and N fertilization affect yield and yield components of oat and pea in intercrops. *Field Crops Research* **179**, 113–119.

| [Sowing ratio and N fertilization affect yield and yield components of oat and pea in intercrops.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Odabaş MS, Mut Z (2007) Modeling the effect of temperature on percentage and duration of seed germination in grain legumes and cereals. *American Journal of Plant Physiology* **2**, 303–310.

Perenzin M, Notario T (2014) Le varietà di avena per le semine 2014. *L'Informatore Agrario* **70**, 55–58.

Picasso VD, Brummer EC, Liebman M, Dixon PM (2011) Diverse perennial crop mixtures sustain higher productivity over time based on ecological complementarity. *Renewable Agriculture and Food Systems* **26**, 317–327.

| [Diverse perennial crop mixtures sustain higher productivity over time based on ecological complementarity.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Sadras V, Drecer MF (2015) Adaptation of wheat, barley, canola, field pea and chickpea to the thermal environments of Australia. *Crop & Pasture Science* **66**, 1137–1150.

| [Adaptation of wheat, barley, canola, field pea and chickpea to the thermal environments of Australia.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Schipanski ME, Drinkwater LE (2012) Nitrogen fixation in annual and perennial legume-grass mixtures across a fertility gradient. *Plant and Soil* **357**, 147–159.

| [Nitrogen fixation in annual and perennial legume-grass mixtures across a fertility gradient.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) | [1:CAS:528:DC%2BC38XhtVegt7nP&md5=bc7b8527ca898294c98912a8b966a857CAS](#) |

Siddique KHM, Loss SP, Regan KL, Jettner RL (1999) Adaptation and seed yield of cool season grain legumes in Mediterranean environments of south-western Australia. *Australian Journal of Agricultural Research* **50**, 375–388.

| [Adaptation and seed yield of cool season grain legumes in Mediterranean environments of south-western Australia.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Thomson BD, Siddique KHM, Barr MD, Wilson JM (1997) Grain legume species in low rainfall Mediterranean-type environments. I. Phenology and seed yield. *Field Crops Research* **54**, 173–187.

| [Grain legume species in low rainfall Mediterranean-type environments. I. Phenology and seed yield.Crossref](#) | [GoogleScholar](#)[Google Scholar](#) |

Zandstra HG, Price EC, Litsinger JA, Morris RA (1981) 'A methodology for on-farm cropping system research.' (IRRI: Manila, The Philippines)